



Needs Assessment Committee

Meeting Minutes

Thursday, March 23, 2006

Shelby County Archives Building

150 Washington, 2nd Floor

Committee members present:

Scott Fleming, Chairman

Nick Clark, Vice-Chairman

Nisha Powers, Secretary

Commissioner David Lillard

Jay Weatherington

Dr. Thomas Glass

Aubrey Howard

Sara Lewis

Commissioner Deidre Malone

Committee members absent:

Cato Johnson, Vice-Chairman

David Pickler

NAC Consultants: DeJong/JAED

Carolyn Staskiewicz, DeJong

School personnel present:

Dr. Carol Johnson, Superintendent, MCS

Michael Goar, Chief Operating Officer, MCS

Leonard Myers, MCS

Brian Shipp, MCS

James Bacchus, Executive Director of Facilities Planning, MCS

Emmett M. McKnight, Jr., MCS

Tom Marshall, EFS, MCS Consultant

Jimmie Tucker, EFS, MCS Consultant

Allan Barner, EFS, MCS Consultant

Dr. Bobby Webb, Superintendent, SCS

Dr. Richard Holden, Assistant Superintendent, SCS

Ms. Maura Sullivan, Director, Research and Planning, SCS

Shelby County Administration and Staff:

John Fowlkes, CAO

James Huntzicker, Director, Finance and Administration

Grace Hutchinson, Deputy Director, Finance and Administration

Louise Mercuro, Deputy Director, Planning and Development

Shobhan Koneru, Senior Planner, Planning and Development

Marion Jones, Senior Planner, Planning and Development

Visitors:

Dr. Susan Roakes, U of M, Dept. of City and Regional Planning

Patrice Robinson, Member, Memphis Board of Education

Steve Hill, PHD

George Lord, Partners in Public Education (PIPE)

Joanna Curtis, PIPE

Chairman Fleming called the meeting to order at 9:15 AM.

1. Welcome**2. Approval of January 20, 2006 Minutes**

Chairman Fleming said the meeting minutes were being copied and approval of the meeting minutes would be deferred until the heel of the agenda.

3. Shelby County Schools

- ◆ **Consideration of amending the Capital Improvements Budget for 2005-2006 by the sum of “\$3,000,000.00 to SCS for additions to existing school facilities and /or construction of permanent school facilities in the Southeast area of Shelby County to relieve critical overcrowding of schools in that area.”**

Dr. Holden stated SCS would be making a presentation on two new projects. Although these projects were discussed with NAC at the December and January meetings, there was no formal presentation.

Below are highlights from the formal presentation by SCS representatives:

- ◆ A 300 student addition of approximately 16,000 square feet is proposed for Southwind Middle School to alleviate overcrowding. Southwind Middle School currently has 7 portable classrooms on site. Rezoning students to other area schools for the 2006-2007 school year will provide a short-term solution. The addition is needed to relieve overcrowding of area middle schools and accommodate continued growth in this sector of Shelby County. Total projected cost for this addition is \$1,730,400.00. SCS estimates costs for this project to be \$90.00 per square foot as compared to the SCS general figure of \$80.00 per square foot.
- ◆ A 300 student addition of approximately 16,000 square feet is proposed for Highland Oaks Elementary School to alleviate overcrowding. Highland Oaks Elementary School currently has 19 portable classrooms on site. Rezoning students to other area schools for the 2006-2007 school year will provide a short-term solution. The addition is needed to relieve overcrowding of existing elementary schools and accommodate continued growth in this sector of Shelby County. Total projected cost for this addition is \$1,730,400.00. SCS estimates

costs for this project to be \$90.00 per square foot as compared to the SCS general figure of \$80.00 per square foot.

Questions and comments:

Mr. Clark asked if the City of Memphis annexes the area, what percentage of the addition would be needed and what the long-term effect would be on brick and mortar? Mrs. Sullivan responded there is limited space in the Collierville area and there is a rezoning proposal to allow use of the space in Collierville in this area. MCS is at capacity with no additional space. Mrs. Sullivan felt there was not as much retail to create changes as there was in Hickory Hill.

Mrs. Powers asked about the methodology used for the projections. Mrs. Sullivan stated she applied growth rate figures from the last three years to the capacity/enrollment data. Mrs. Powers also asked how annexation would affect the school. Mrs. Sullivan stated both school systems run similar programs. The school would be constructed with standard size classrooms. The similarity between the school system standards requires little modification, particularly between elementary and middle schools. There would not be as many changes although the wiring for computers classes would require changes. Dr. Johnson felt the numbers depended in part on where you draw the boundaries whether if there is excess space or overcrowding. Dr. Johnson stated there needs to be a joint conversation regarding construction so it is cost effective. Mrs. Sullivan stated SCS had done this in the past. Dr. Holden directed attention to Roman numerals XV and XVI. Dr. Holden stated it would take 9 months to complete the addition on a regular construction schedule and would cost approximately \$90 per square, slightly higher than the SCS normal cost. To better achieve an economy of scale, SCS would assign one architect and one contractor to both school additions.

Commissioner Lillard suggested a historical perspective or timeline approach. Something slid. How did we get where we are today? It sounded like we were in passable shape, now this issue. Dr. Holden responded there was a delay in the purchase of land for the southeast school that put us past 2006 and beyond 2007 due to no land. Several land brokers were contacted, but the sites were unbuildable due to ARAP ditches. There was a split past 2007. We cannot make the August 2007 deadline today. Commissioner Lillard asked if we will slide further. Dr. Holden responded it would be soon or never.

Commissioner Lillard stated the situation needs to be addressed from 2 levels.

1. Process: There needs to be a neighborhood/City/County wide perspective where each quadrant composed of the City/County facilities are reviewed for capacity.
2. Projections: Adopt where we are in regard to interim facilities. The SCS proposal may or may not take 1 year off.

Commissioner Lillard referred to SCS presentation on Southwind as an example. The parents wanted a neighborhood school. On the other hand, look at the process. There is a further needed step that is the NAC charge. There is a need to go from the very general to a better drill down. Schnuck's is the classic situation to avoid- a throw away school.

Commissioner Malone stated we should view in terms of capacity in SCS and place students in other County schools. Dr. Holden responded this is part of the plan. Commissioner Malone was concerned about the close proximity of the Schnuck's school to alcohol and tobacco. Commissioner Malone stated there is a nice size transportation budget. SCS will present rezoning proposal today to SCS Board. There was an exchange between Mr., Huntzicker, Dr. Webb and Dr. Holden regarding the Schnuck's site and the need for additional portables. A discussion regarding whether it would be better to transport students to a temporary school or to portables classrooms ensued. The additional portable classrooms that would be available from the temporary school would be used elsewhere in the SCS school system.

Dr. Johnson wanted a summary of the request. Dr. Johnson felt there was possibly a middle school request in the future (page. 3, Section P of the SCS handout). SCS officials stated there is a request by SCS and approved by the SCS Board, but will not be before NAC until 2008. Dr. Holden stated SCS is looking at elementary and middle schools. Dr. Johnson stated there needs to be a dialogue between SCS and MCS to avoid double counting and to make sure there is no misconceptions about what is being done. Mrs. Sullivan stated there is always a dialogue between the two school systems. Dr. Johnson felt the projected growth rate is suspect. In the long-term after areas are annexed for five years by the City of Memphis, MCS has less of a growth rate.

Chairman Fleming asked how can we get our arms around that? Louise Mercurio stated DPD is putting that information together now. DPD is observing the development patterns. Ms. Mercurio suggested the Southeast boundaries are not static. The area is beginning smaller, dense lot build out. Further east, there will be large lot development of the area. Ms. Mercurio stated she would report back to NAC shortly. DPD is beginning projections in the Mary's Creek area.

Mr. Goar stated there needs to be some level of drill down in the process for capital issues regarding school facilities for him to have a comfort level. Proposals need to be mapped out and discussed before presentation to NAC. Chairman Fleming responded there needs to be dialogue between SCS and MCS on when areas will be annexed. Dr. Holden responded SCS met with MCS regarding the Southeast high school, but had not heard anything. The Southeast elementary school was not discussed. Mrs. Sullivan responded that the Hickory Hill Joint Agreement required joint staff meeting, but the meetings stopped and have not occurred in the last several years. Dr. Holden stated that a joint meeting on the elementary school located on the Schnuck's site could not occur until the information was presented to the SCS Board. Chairman Fleming felt the joint meetings made too much sense to avoid and asked both school systems to dovetail their efforts. Chairman Fleming felt both school systems were moving together, at least, in the last several years.

Mr. Clark felt southeast Shelby County is a contained area. A master plan is needed for this area. Ultimately, this area will be annexed by the City of Memphis. The SCS school district will not change. Mr. Clark proposed taking on the Southeast Shelby County Area first. Chairman Fleming asked for thoughts or comments on this idea. President Lewis stated she and Deny Hirsch were assigned to work on this area. MCS wants to be a part of the dialogue and will be available for the joint meeting. Commissioner Lillard suggested regular meetings every 60 days between the two school systems for the

Southeast Shelby County Area and other areas for planning purposes. Commissioner Lillard further stated the process is in need of reform with respect to identifying future use needs. Part of the process is to quantify and detail what is needed. The out of sight, out of mind approach hurts the schools systems.

Mr. Howard felt it would be easier for an individual body to do the planning. Mr. Howard felt NAC was faced with two equally bad choices, and the question is which bad alternative is cheaper? It will cost \$339,000.00 per year to lease the Schnuck's site plus another \$1.5 Million for partitions and transportation of students to Collierville. Dr. Webb felt a combination of both solutions was needed. Mrs. Robinson asked what is going to happen in the future regarding joint use of school facilities. There is desire for the school to be located so the school is a part of the community. There is a need to create a joint use facility. MCS, Shelby County Board of Commissioners and Memphis City Council should all look at this and contribute.

MOTION: Mr. Clark made a motion for NAC to address the need for additions to Highland Oaks Elementary School and Southwind Middle School and the projected cost of \$3.46 Million as referenced in the SCS documentation. Mr. Weatherington seconded the motion.

Chairman Fleming asked for discussion among the Board.

Mr. Howard stated he had so many questions about effectiveness of use coupled with no dialogue between SCS and MCS. Mr. Clark stated more dialogue would be good, but the two requests serve to force our hand. Mr. Howard asked as a procedural question if the motion included #4. Mr. Clark responded by stating it does not, NAC approves needs, but not funding.

Mr. Howard asked about the approximate \$7.7 Million due to MCS for ADA requirements. Chairman Fleming stated MCS must present specific needs and requests. Mr. Clark stated NAC recommends needs, not funding. Commissioner Lillard stated he did not like where the NAC is going on this. Commissioner Lillard urged NAC to make sure it is not in this position again. The biggest lesson learned is to figure out the process so this does not happen again. Commissioner Malone stated this really makes me feel uncomfortable. Traditionally, I do not vote outside the budget. Commissioner Malone stated she hopes this is not a band aid approach. Mr. Weatherington expressed concerns regarding the portable classrooms and felt a storm or some other situation could hurt the children in portable classrooms.

Commissioner Lillard recognized President Lewis. President Lewis stated her understanding is crystal clear. MCS is aware of the problems and has a committee to work with our peers. President Lewis felt MCS should be involved as equal partners. Our staff is here. Mr. Goar will meet as frequently as necessary

VOTE: Mr. Weatherington called the question. The majority of the committee approved the motion. Mr. Howard asked to be shown as passing.

Dr. Holden stated the exact amount does not match the capital report to the SCS Board. Dr. Holden wanted clarification to make sure the motion contained the \$3 Million extra plus the \$4 Million already budgeted for a total of \$7 Million.

Amendment to Approved Motion and Vote: Mr. Clark moved that the funding amount be revised to \$3 Million in total. Commissioner Malone seconded the motion. The \$3 Million will match the amount referenced by Commissioner Bailey. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the NAC Members present.

3. Memphis City Schools

♦ Presentation of Master Plan

- ♦ Consideration of amending the Capital Improvement Budget for 2005-2006 by the sum of \$7,750,000.00 (estimated) to be appropriated to MCS for the ADA share.**

President Lewis stated achieving excellence in our community means all deserve an equal opportunity to learn. Some facilities are adequate and some are not. MCS turned to EFS to create the 5 year master plan to remedy the facility situation. Only by achieving adequacy in each school is there adequacy in all schools. President Lewis stated the MCS Board of Education has not voted on or discussed the plan. MCS and Commissioners have just recently completed a 5 district tour and EFS will resubmit its recommendations to the Board. The Board will vote on the Master Plan after EFS makes recommendations and when review by the superintendent's staff is completed. The original presentation to the Board took 4 1/2 hours. Mr. Marshall has been asked to scale the presentation down to 60 minutes.

Mr. Marshall's staff passed our copies of the PowerPoint presentation.

Mr. Marshall stated Planned Z busing formula was implemented to accomplish desegregation among 28 satellite zones for the purpose of achieving racial integration. At present, MCS is approximately 86-88% African American. Equality may be achieved by achieving adequacy.

Currently, MCS has 11 grade configurations. With the Master Plan, 4 configurations are proposed. For each school there is an established floor plan in yellow as well as a yellow utilization sheet to determine the mixture of core and specialty classrooms. A pink sheet yields a floor plan for better economy and a matrix sheet provides an estimate of the cost to fix the existing facility. 85% of the core utilization of facilities is defined by State requirements. MCS currently has 350 portable classrooms system wide. One of our goals is 0 portable classrooms within 5 years. The Master plan establishes attendance zones that use natural and man-made boundaries and that make sense. The Master Plan establishes standard procedures to estimate school capacities. Five School Planning Zones were created based on high school attendance boundaries.

Zone 1 is the Raleigh-Frayser Area. Zone 1 Elementary School Highlights are:

- ◆ Maintain Optional Program (K-5 Level) at Keystone, while providing opportunities for neighborhood enrollment
- ◆ Proposed closure of Denver Elementary
- ◆ Expansion of Egypt with 10 CR addition
- ◆ Adjust attendance boundaries for continuity, safety, transportation costs, & overcrowding

Zone 1 Middle School Highlights include:

- ◆ New middle school near Baber Park (900 student capacity)
- ◆ Expand Georgian Hills Middle to a capacity of 900 students
- ◆ Convert Westside High to Westside Middle
- ◆ Adjust attendance boundaries for continuity, safety, transportation costs, & crowding.

Zone 1 High School Highlights are as follows:

- ◆ Frayser and Trezevant will become 9-12 high schools
- ◆ Westside High converted to middle school
- ◆ Scenic Hills Area High Schools students reassigned from Raleigh Egypt to Cragmont High
- ◆ Adjust attendance zone boundaries for continuity, safety, transportation costs, & crowding

Zone 2 includes the Center City and Downtown Area. The following are proposed as Zone 2 elementary school highlights:

- ◆ Proposed facility closings include Caldwell, Lauderdale and South Area Office
- ◆ Relocate KIPP Academy to Hollywood Elementary
- ◆ Explore facility use at A.B. Hill (Pre-K)
- ◆ Build replacement school at Georgia Avenue Elementary
- ◆ Convert Douglass to K-8 School (Currently K-5)
- ◆ Alton to become K-5 school (Currently K-4)
- ◆ Place Orleans on Watchlist
- ◆ Adjust attendance boundaries for continuity, safety, transportation costs, & crowding

Zone 2 Middle School Highlights:

- ◆ Relocate Longview Middle School
- ◆ Convert South Side High to South Side Middle School
- ◆ Relocate KIPP Academy to Hollywood Elementary
- ◆ Adjust attendance boundaries for continuity, safety, transportation costs, & crowding

Zone 2 High School Highlight are as follows:

- ◆ New high school in Douglass area with capacity of 800 students
- ◆ Convert South Side High School to South Side Middle School
- ◆ Assign South Side High students to Carver and Hamilton
- ◆ Adjust attendance boundaries for continuity, safety, transportation costs, & crowding

Zone 3 is characterized as the East Memphis & Cordova Area. Zone 3 Elementary School Highlights include:

- ◆ Proposed closure of Macon Elementary
- ◆ Convert Lester Elementary to K-8 school
- ◆ New elementary school near Macon & Whitten Area
- ◆ Expand Kate Bond Campus to K-8
- ◆ Adjust attendance boundaries for continuity, safety, transportation costs, & crowding

The following recommendations are Zone 3 Middle School Highlights:

- ◆ Convert Treadwell High to middle school (6-8)
- ◆ Phase in middle school at Lester
- ◆ Create middle school facility at Kate Bond Site (K-8 Campus)
- ◆ Build replacement school at Colonial Middle
- ◆ Adjust attendance boundaries for continuity, safety, transportation costs, & crowding

Zone 3 High School Highlights include:

- ◆ Convert Kingsbury High to exclusive 9-12
- ◆ Convert East High to exclusive 9-12
- ◆ Adjust attendance boundaries for continuity, safety, transportation costs, & crowding

Whitehaven & Levi compose Zone 4. The following are Zone 4 Elementary School Highlights:

- ◆ Proposed closure of Manor Lake Elementary School
- ◆ Convert Graceland Elementary to K-8 school
- ◆ 8 CR addition to Lakeview Elementary
- ◆ Grave's, White's Chapel, and Coro Lake Elementary Schools will be on Watchlist
- ◆ Adjust attendance boundaries for continuity, safety, transportation costs, & crowding

Zone 4 Middle School Highlights include:

- ◆ Convert Graceland Elementary School into K-8 school with additions and renovations
- ◆ Convert Ford Road Elementary into K-8 school with additions and renovations

- ◆ Expansion of Chickasaw Middle School from 644 to 750 student capacity
- ◆ Adjust attendance boundaries for continuity, safety, transportation costs, & crowding

Zone 4 High School Highlights require an adjustment to attendance boundaries for continuity, safety, transportation costs, & crowding.

The Southeast and Balmoral Area comprise Zone 5. Zone 5 Elementary School Highlights include the following:

- ◆ Proposed conversion of Ridgeway Elementary School into 9th grade academy
- ◆ Assign Ridgeway Elementary students to Balmoral Elementary School
- ◆ Build a new Airport Area K-8 school in the Oakhaven Area to accommodate 1,200 students. Current K-5 students located in this district will attend Ross and Getwell until new school is built
- ◆ Re-assign northern part of Ridgeway Elementary School students to Shady Grove Elementary (Zone 3)
- ◆ Adjust attendance boundaries for continuity, safety, transportation costs, & crowding.

Zone 5 Middle School Highlights are:

- ◆ Build a new K-8 school in the Airport Area to accommodate 1,200 students
- ◆ 12 CR addition to Hickory Ridge Middle
- ◆ Adjust attendance boundaries for continuity, safety, transportation costs, & crowding.

Zone 5 High School Highlights:

- ◆ 10 CR addition to Wooddale High
- ◆ Oakhaven becomes 9-12 high school
- ◆ Adjust attendance boundaries for continuity, safety, transportation costs, & crowding

The 5 Year Facilities Master Plan Summary calls for:

1. Minor renovations are suggested to Cypress MS, Richland ES, Lakeview ES and Oak Forest ES.
2. Major renovations are recommended to Georgian Hills MS, Brookmeade ES, Humes MS, Chickasaw MS, Hickory Ridge MS, Douglass K-8, Lester ES, Egypt ES, Trezevant HS, Graceland K-8, Fairview MS, Snowden K-8, White Station HS and Wooddale HS.
3. Conversions are planned for Westside MS, South Side MS, Treadwell MS, Ford Road K-8, and Douglass K-8.
4. New schools are recommended for Baber Park MS, Douglass HS, Whitten Area ES, Kate Bond MS and Airport K-8.

5. Replace buildings at the current site for Georgia Avenue ES and Colonial MS.
6. Closures are suggested for Denver ES, Hollywood ES, Caldwell ES, Longview MS, Lauderdale ES, Manor Lake ES, Balmoral ES/Ridgeway ES and Macon ES.
7. Watchlist schools are Coro Lake ES, White's Chapel ES, Graves ES, Shady Grove ES and Orleans ES.

Questions and comments:

Chairman Fleming said NAC waited 1 ½ years to get the report. Great job! Chairman Fleming encouraged NAC members to review the document.

Mr. Clark stated the plan required an excess of funds and asked if the plan took into account savings on the operational side? Mr. Marshall responded by saying there are a variety of savings on the operational side. When asked about the specifics, Mr. Marshall responded the savings are projected to be \$41 Million over five years for the proposed closures. Mr. Marshall indicated NAC would need to see what was adopted before an estimate of operational serving could be accurately projected.

Mr. Clark asked why a five year mark was used. Mr. Clark felt the plan should prioritize funds. Mr. Marshall responded that the Master Plan will do that. Dr. Johnson explained there were other pieces to the Master Plan such as the Watchlist which give communities a head ups to potential closures. MCS will monitor enrollment and demographic information for Watchlist schools over a five year period. The five year period allows MCS to reassess and re-evaluate these changes.

ACTION: Chairman Fleming encouraged MCS to submit the additional information for NAC use and said the NAC take the Master Plan under advisement until the next meeting.

Mr. Clark asked if the Master Plan would replace the capital funding needs from last year. Mr. Marshall stated it would. Mr. Clark inquired about the changes. Mr. Marshall explained there were larger needs such as deferred maintenance. A question was asked regarding their location in the Master Plan. Dr. Johnson explained the timeline for the Master Plan. The Board's timeline for the Master Plan is April; there will be feedback from the closings; a revised summary is due in the Fall; and a final report is due in December. Dr. Johnson stated MCS wants the parent to know in advance of the 2007-8 school year, where their child will attend school. There will be some changes including land acquisition in the Kate Bond area.

MOTION: A motion was made to amend the Capital Improvement Budget for 2005-2006 by the sum of "\$7,500,000.00 (estimated) to be appropriated to MCS for the ADA share". Commissioner Deidre Malone seconded the motion.

Mr. Clark asked how the funds would be appropriated. Mr. Goar responded by saying MCS will set a road map. Priority will be placed on routine maintenance and ADA needs. Dr. Johnson stated the funds would be used for ADA requirements, HVAC and some land acquisition.

ACTION: Commissioner Lillard requested a specific list of projects for which funds would be used and stated there needs to be more drill down in the future. President Lewis pledged MCS will do that.

Mrs. Hutchins said she would contact the Shelby County Conservation Board regarding the land adjacent to Kate Bond Middle School. Dr. Johnson said a land donation would be great.

VOTE: The motion was approved by a unanimous voice of the NAC Members present.

Chairman Fleming stated he would mail out the committee meeting minutes within the next week. The December and January meeting minutes will be voted on at the next meeting. Chairman Fleming indicated the next meeting date was not set at this time. The Chairman also indicated a meeting with Mrs. Staskiewicz would occur after this meeting to lay out the NAC Plan.

Commissioner Lillard suggested using City zones and other zones outside the system.

Mr. Clark asked if Commissioners Lillard and Malone the County Commission through the Education Committee would make a formal request to the Shelby County Board of Conservation regarding the land adjacent to Kate Bond Middle School or if this was something NAC should initiate. Commissioner Lillard advised this was something staff should look into to determine if there was a true need for the land. Commissioner Malone felt a motion should be made and if was not needed, it was fine. Commissioner Lillard felt the motion should wait until the next meeting which would be soon.

MOTION: Commissioner Malone made a motion to recommend to the Shelby County Conservation Board to donate land adjacent to Kate Bond Middle School if there was no true need for the land. Sara Lewis seconded the motion. The motion passed by a unanimous vote of the NAC Members present.

Dr. Glass told Chairman Fleming he would need time at the next meeting to address concerns, particularly special education concerns.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:30 AM.

Respectfully submitted,

Nisha Powers, Secretary

Date

NP/mmj